



This information is available free of charge in electronic, audio, Braille and large print versions on request.

For assistance in understanding or reading this document or specific information about these Minutes please call Democratic Services on 01629 761133 or e-mail committee@derbyshiredales.gov.uk

PLANNING COMMITTEE

Minutes of a Meeting held on Tuesday 22 July 2015 at 6.00pm at Ashbourne Elim Pentecostal Church, Ashbourne.

PRESENT

Councillor Garry Purdy - In the Chair

Councillors Jason Atkin, Sue Bull, Martin Burfoot, Albert Catt, Tom Donnelly, Graham Elliott, Helen Froggatt, Neil Horton, Angus Jenkins, Tony Millward, BEM, Tony Morley, Mike Ratcliffe, Lewis Rose, OBE, Peter Slack, Andrew Statham and Jo Wild

Jon Bradbury (Development Manager), Chris Whitmore (Area Planning Officer), Brett Wilson (Barrister), Sarah Gee (Solicitor) and Christine Laver (Democratic Services Team Leader).

65 members of the public.

APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Richard Bright, Sue Burfoot and Richard FitzHerbert. Councillors Martin Burfoot, Angus Jenkins and Jo Wild attended as Substitute Members.

93/15 – MINUTES

It was moved by Councillor Garry Purdy, seconded by Councillor Tony Millward and

RESOLVED

(unanimously)

That the minutes of the Planning Committee held on 14 July 2015 be approved as a correct record.

The Minutes were signed by the Chairman.

94/15 – MEMBERS' INTERESTS

With regard to application no 15/00089/FUL Councillor Angus Jenkins declared an interest in that one of the objectors was his cousin. This did not constitute a disclosable pecuniary interest and Councillor Jenkins was present during discussion and voting on this item.

95/15 – APPLICATION NO. 15/00270/FUL – TWO STOREY BUILDING TO PROVIDE RETAIL UNITS, SPA, SALON AND OFFICE SPACE, INCLUDING ALTERATION TO EXISTING BUILDING AT LAND OFF HORSE AND JOCKEY YARD, ST JOHN STREET, ASHBOURNE

Details of an email, received after publication of the agenda, from Matthew Montague, the applicant's representative, were circulated at the meeting. This detailed proposed actions in response to a recommendation for refusal of the application based on the comments of the Conservation Advisory Forum and a holding objection from Derbyshire County Council on archaeological grounds.

The applicant believed that the Conservation Forum's objections could be overcome through design changes and confirmed that an archaeological field evaluation had been commissioned, as requested by DCC's Archaeologist.

In view of the above actions, the applicant requested that consideration of the application be deferred until the necessary amendments to the proposal had been submitted.

It was moved by Councillor Garry Purdy, seconded by Councillor Sue Bull and

RESOLVED That consideration of the application be deferred to enable the
(Unanimously) applicant to address the comments of the Conservation Advisory Forum and to undertake an archaeological field evaluation as requested by Derbyshire County Council.

96/15 - APPLICATION NO. 15/00279/FUL – CHANGE OF USE OF LAND TO 3MW SOLAR FARM WITH ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE AT LADY HOLE FARM, LADYHOLE LANE, YELDERSLEY

The Committee visited the site prior to the meeting to consider the impact of the proposed development within the immediate and wider landscape.

A correction to the information given in the report was circulated at the meeting. The Area Planning Officer confirmed that Grade II listed Firs Farm Barns were approximately 0.8km to the south east of the site and not west of the site as stated in the report.

In accordance with the procedure for public participation Ms Charlotte Mayall, representing the applicant, Soil and Sun Ltd, spoke in favour of the application.

It was moved by Councillor Mike Ratcliffe, seconded by Councillor Peter Slack and

RESOLVED That planning permission be granted, subject to the conditions
(Unanimously) detailed in the report.

97/15 – APPLICATION NO. 15/00089/FUL – CHANGE OF USE OF LAND TO SOLAR FARM WITH ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE, LAND AT DAYFIELDS FARM, ATLOW

The Committee visited the site prior to the meeting to consider the impact of the proposed development within the immediate and wider landscape.

The Development Manager noted that an amended plan had been received, showing deer fencing in place of the palisade fencing shown on the original application.

Details of the consultation response from Atlow Parish and a representation against were circulated at the meeting.

In accordance with the procedure for public participation, the following people made representations relating to this application.

Speaking against the application

Suzanna Monteith, representing Atlow Parish Meeting
Timothy Court, Jane Bonsall, John Gregory, David Monteith, Kathleen Smith, Nick Harcus and Frances Monteith, all local residents.

Speaking in favour of the application

Pam Archer, owner of the site
Roy Amner, representing TGC Renewables, the applicant.

It was moved by Councillor Peter Slack and seconded by Councillor Neil Horton

That planning permission be granted, with an additional condition to require a photographic survey of the road edges on the single track access route prior to commencement of work on the site.

Voting	In favour	6
	Against	11
	Abstentions	0

The Chairman declared the motion LOST.

It was moved by Councillor Lewis Rose, seconded by Councillor Tony Morley and

RESOLVED That planning permission be refused.

Reason for Refusal

The harm to the landscape character and appearance outweighs the benefit of the renewable energy to be generated and, as such, is in conflict with policies CS5, SF4 and NBE8 of the Local Plan and guidance in the National Planning Policy Framework taken as a whole.

Voting	In favour	11
	Against	6
	Abstentions	0

The Chairman declared the motion CARRIED.

98/15 – APPLICATION NO. 15/00319/OUT – RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT OF UP TO 115 DWELLINGS WITH ASSOCIATED PUBLIC OPEN SPACE (OUTLINE) AT LEYS FARM, WYASTON ROAD, ASHBOURNE

The Committee visited the site, prior to the meeting, in order to fully appreciate the impact of the proposed development on the landscape and the road network.

In accordance with the procedure for public participation the following people made representations in relation to this application.

Speaking against the application

Councillor Lucy Green, representing Ashbourne Town Council
Bettina Lange, Planning and Transport Advisor, CPRE
Hannah Lakin, Richard Lakin, Peter Fox, Denise Brown, Mrs Orme (also representing John Dudfield), Steve Challoner, Colin Loud, Chris Kidger Poole and Patrick Kerr, all local residents.

It was moved by Councillor Tony Millward and seconded by Councillor Tom Donnelly

That planning permission be refused.

Reason for Refusal

The site comprises of green fields outside the existing settlement framework of Ashbourne. The proposed development of the site, with up to 115 dwellings, is considered to constitute an unsustainable form of development as it will individually, and cumulatively with other planned residential development around the town, be likely to lead to a significant increase in traffic congestion. In addition the site is considered to be relatively remote from existing community infrastructure and services and does not incorporate the provision of additional facilities, such that future residents will be reliant on the private car to access facilities in leading their daily lives, thereby exacerbating its impact on the local road network. As such the adverse impacts of the proposed residential development are considered to significantly and demonstrably outweigh its benefits, when assessed against the policies of the NPPF taken as a whole.

Councillors Mike Ratcliffe and Tony Millward requested a recorded vote in accordance with the District Council’s Rule of Procedure 19(d)

Voting	In favour	Councillors Sue Bull, Martin Burfoot, Tom Donnelly and Tony Millward (4)
	Against	Councillors Jason Atkin, Albert Catt, Graham Elliott, Helen Froggatt, Neil Horton, Angus Jenkins, Tony Morley, Garry Purdy, Mike Ratcliffe, Lewis Rose, Andrew Statham, Jo Wild (12)
	Abstentions	Councillor Peter Slack (1)

The Chairman declared the motion LOST.

It was moved by Councillor Lewis Rose, seconded by Councillor Jo Wild and

RESOLVED That planning permission be granted, subject to the conditions detailed in the report.

Voting	In favour	Councillors Jason Atkin, Albert Catt, Graham Elliott, Helen Froggatt, Neil Horton, Angus Jenkins, Tony Morley, Garry Purdy, Mike Ratcliffe, Lewis Rose, Andrew Statham, Jo Wild (12)
	Against	Councillors Sue Bull, Martin Burfoot, Tom Donnelly, Tony Millward, Peter Slack (5)
	Abstentions	(0)

The Chairman declared the motion CARRIED.

MEETING CLOSED – 8.45 PM

Chairman